
Subject: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 01:36:17 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

If a tree falls in the forest, and no one is around to hear it... does it make a sound?

I been having a pretty heated discussion about this on another forum. The person I am arguing says that it has to make sound waves, so it has to make sound.

But my opinion is that just because there are sound waves doesn't mean there is a sound. A sound wave is how a sound travels, the sound is made when someone is there to receive the sound. So with nothing there to receive the sound, I say it doesn't make a sound.

But what do you guys think?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 01:50:07 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

<http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/Sound>
sound1

1. the sensation produced by stimulation of the organs of hearing by vibrations transmitted through the air or other medium.

So thus, no... it does not make a sound... by the first definition. The second definition:

2. mechanical vibrations transmitted through an elastic medium, traveling in air at a speed of approximately 1087 ft. (331 m) per second at sea level.

So thus, yes... It usually depends on how you would define a sound.

Conclusion: Yes & No.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Nukelt15](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 01:51:15 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Just because no person is around does not mean that a sound is not heard. Unless the tree falls also in a forest that lacks any form of animal life, the sound is still heard by something.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 01:54:06 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Nukelt15 wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 20:51 Just because no person is around does not mean that a sound is not heard. Unless the tree falls also in a forest that lacks any form of animal life, the sound is still heard by something.

No
it's obvious.

Body

1. the physical structure and material substance of an animal or plant, living or dead.

So thus, nobody... meaning no living thing.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Renerage](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:14:55 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

It still makes a sound, but no one can hear it.

There, topic over.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Starbuzz](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:19:29 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

What a gay thread lol...of course the damned tree makes a sound! Just because there were no receptors (humans) around to hear it does not mean the tree fell silently.

Topic over, +1 post and I AM COLONEL!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Renerage](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:21:08 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Put up something that is a non-animate object.

Like a microphone.

Let the tree fall, while your 20394803924 miles away,

Go back a few weeks later, make sure your not anywhere near it,

Re-listen to the recording-

ZOMGS, IT MADE A SOUND!!!!

HIERACY!

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:22:34 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Of course, it makes a sound. If it's in a forest, the sound waves are being received by other plant matter around it, whether it be brush or other trees. After all, it is in a FOREST, right?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Renerage](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:30:15 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

What if the person had a stealth suit?
ZOMGS HAX!

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:39:49 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Renerage wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 21:21 Put up something that is a non-animate object.
Like a microphone.

Let the tree fall, while your 20394803924 miles away,
Go back a few weeks later, make sure your not anywhere near it,
Re-listen to the recording-
ZOMGS, IT MADE A SOUND!!!!
HIERACY!

You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.

Quote:It still makes a sound, but no one can hear it.

There, topic over.

Did you read my first post in the topic?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 02:56:20 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:39 You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.

If it's a duplication, isn't that proof that an original exists?

If I make a copy of an image, the duplication is proof that an original existed. You can't duplicate something if it never existed.

If you create a new MP3, it's not a duplication. It's the original MP3 that you created. If someone else has a COPY (or 'duplication') of your MP3, then it proves there was an original, else it wouldn't exist.

The question isn't whether someone HEARS the sound that it makes, but DOES it make a sound? If we have a duplication, then deductive reasoning proves that it does, indeed, make a sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Renegade](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:01:21 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:56BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:39You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.
If it's a duplication, isn't that proof that an original exists?

If I make a copy of an image, the duplication is proof that an original existed. You can't duplicate something if it never existed.

If you create a new MP3, it's not a duplication. It's the original MP3 that you created. If someone else has a COPY (or 'duplication') of your MP3, then it proves there was an original, else it wouldn't exist.

The question isn't whether someone HEARS the sound that it makes, but DOES it make a sound? If we have a duplication, then deductive reasoning proves that it does, indeed, make a sound.

Not by bluethen's logic.

How about this one smarty pants-

If you have a DEAF guy in the room, and you scream in his face.

Do you still make a sound?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:05:49 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Renegade wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 23:01cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:56BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:39You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.

If it's a duplication, isn't that proof that an original exists?

If I make a copy of an image, the duplication is proof that an original existed. You can't duplicate something if it never existed.

If you create a new MP3, it's not a duplication. It's the original MP3 that you created. If someone else has a COPY (or 'duplication') of your MP3, then it proves there was an original, else it wouldn't exist.

The question isn't whether someone HEARS the sound that it makes, but DOES it make a sound? If we have a duplication, then deductive reasoning proves that it does, indeed, make a sound.

Not by bluethen's logic.

How about this one smarty pants-

If you have a DEAF guy in the room, and you scream in his face.

Do you still make a sound?

Pfft, even by his logic I win.

The "organs of hearing" can be what receives the soundwaves on the recorder.

As for your question... yes, it makes a sound. Just because the brain doesn't receive any signals from the ears doesn't mean that the ears aren't receiving the sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [bisen11](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:08:54 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

There's also Elves and leprechauns in the forest. It's just that when anyone comes they hide and you can't find them, whatsoever. But when nothing is around, they're definitely there.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:09:35 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:05Renegade wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 23:01cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:56BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:39You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.

If it's a duplication, isn't that proof that an original exists?

If I make a copy of an image, the duplication is proof that an original existed. You can't duplicate something if it never existed.

If you create a new MP3, it's not a duplication. It's the original MP3 that you created. If someone else has a COPY (or 'duplication') of your MP3, then it proves there was an original, else it wouldn't exist.

The question isn't whether someone HEARS the sound that it makes, but DOES it make a sound? If we have a duplication, then deductive reasoning proves that it does, indeed, make a sound.

Not by bluethen's logic.

How about this one smarty pants-

If you have a DEAF guy in the room, and you scream in his face.

Do you still make a sound?

Pfft, even by his logic I win.

The "organs of hearing" can be what receives the soundwaves on the recorder.

As for your question... yes, it makes a sound. Just because the brain doesn't receive any signals from the ears doesn't mean that the ears aren't receiving the sound.

But you are not listening to the tree itself. You are listening to the recorder.

An addition to that, you just messed up the whole question, the question was:

If a tree falls in a forest, and no one hears it, does it make a sound?

You basically ignored the part of "no one hears it" by saying that you record it and hear it later.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:16:07 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 23:09cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:05Renerage wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 23:01cheesesoda wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:56BlueThen wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 22:39You'd be listening to a duplicate of the sound, but not the sound itself.

If it's a duplication, isn't that proof that an original exists?

If I make a copy of an image, the duplication is proof that an original existed. You can't duplicate something if it never existed.

If you create a new MP3, it's not a duplication. It's the original MP3 that you created. If someone else has a COPY (or 'duplication') of your MP3, then it proves there was an original, else it wouldn't exist.

The question isn't whether someone HEARS the sound that it makes, but DOES it make a sound? If we have a duplication, then deductive reasoning proves that it does, indeed, make a sound.

Not by bluethen's logic.

How about this one smarty pants-

If you have a DEAF guy in the room, and you scream in his face.

Do you still make a sound?

Pfft, even by his logic I win.

The "organs of hearing" can be what receives the soundwaves on the recorder.

As for your question... yes, it makes a sound. Just because the brain doesn't receive any signals from the ears doesn't mean that the ears aren't receiving the sound.

But you are not listening to the tree itself. You are listening to the recorder.

An addition to that, you just messed up the whole question, the question was:
If a tree falls in a forest, and no one hears it, does it make a sound?

You basically ignored the part of "no one hears it" by saying that you record it and hear it later. I'm sorry, but it's stupid to think that sound is defined correctly as that first definition you gave. Sound is energy, whether or not it's received by hearing organs.

As the MythBusters proved, sound CAN break glass. Glass does not have any organs, especially organs for hearing. Yet, if everybody left the building, the glass would still be broken because of the energy given off by the speakers. That energy is sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:20:06 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Off topic a bit but...

Sound creates waves, and that's because the molecules bounce off of each other. If they are bouncing off of each other and rubbing in on each other as they go along... wouldn't sound create heat?

and heat can be turned into electricity... thus, if we have some loudmouths like troopr02, then we could power a lightbulb!

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 03:39:42 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

I agree with a lot of things here, but something that most of you aren't realizing...

A sound wave itself is how a sound travels from one point to another.

However, if nothing hears the sound, there IS no sound. Your not thinking outside of the box here. Your all to busy thinking of what a tree would in fact sound like if it fell. But the thing is, you wouldn't be hearing any tree fall because you nor anything else is there to hear it.

So therefore, the sound wave is going out so far that it dissipates before anyone can hear it, and thus there is no sound to be heard!

Just because the sound wave is there doesn't mean that is going to make a sound. It all depends on if something is there to hear it or not.

Think of it this way: A sound can't exist if it cannot be heard.

For example, say your def. To you, sound doesn't exist. It may be all around, but specifically to you, sound doesn't exist.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [mrpirate](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 04:01:20 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

if a tree falls in a forest is bluet then still a cheater?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Blazer](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 04:12:46 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Almost the oldest argument ever. There are two schools of thought:

1. A sound is not a sound unless it is heard by something. Sound waves themselves are not a sound. Once the waves strike something that vibrates and is converted to electrical signals to a brain, then there is a "sound". If there is nobody there to convert the soundwaves, there was no sound. The tree fell, there was cause, but no effect.

2. Sound waves do not require physical/electrical conversion to be classified as a sound. The tree falling definitely disturbs the air, creating sound waves. It does not matter that there was nobody there to say "hey I hear I sound", the sound waves are still generated and propagate outward. Sound waves do not operate on the quantum level, the tree fell, it made a sound, there was nobody to hear it, simple as that.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 04:54:08 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 wrote on Thu, 04 October 2007 23:39 So therefore, the sound wave is going out so far that it dissipates before anyone can hear it, and thus there is no sound to be heard!

Saying that means you admit to there being sound... just not one heard by human ears.

razorblade001 Just because the sound wave is there doesn't mean that is going to make a sound. Just because it can't be heard by humans doesn't mean it doesn't make a sound. Dogs can hear

higher frequencies than humans can, but would you dare say that it's not a sound because WE can't hear it?

razorblade001 Think of it this way: A sound can't exist if it cannot be heard.

For example, say your def. To you, sound doesn't exist. It may be all around, but specifically to you, sound doesn't exist.

So a spirit can't exist because it cannot be seen? So atoms didn't exist until they were seen microscopically? Other galaxies didn't exist until they were seen telescopically?

Just because circumstantial situations prevent the said object to be seen/heard doesn't mean that it doesn't exist.

Just because, to you, seeing is believing doesn't mean that a god or gods cannot exist. It's a ludicrous assumption.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Ryu](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 07:25:44 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

It doesn't matter if a person is or isn't around, IT WILL STILL MAKE A SOUND!

We do have animals on this planet, if Wikipedia is to be believed.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 11:09:28 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Cheesesoda, your not getting what I said... of course all that other stuff would still exist (according to most logic anyway)

But a sound is different. I'm talking about using the information in the question, you don't hear the sound, the sound doesn't happen.

I'm betting most people here are probably thinking "Ok, so since no one was around to hear it, if I just imagine what it was like to be there and relate it to the sound of a tree falling, of course it made a sound"

If anyone is thinking like that, your wrong. Your not there, you can't hear it if your not there.

The tree falls down, causing soundwaves to spread out. However, nothing is within the range of the sound waves that are going to hear the sound before it dissipates. If your not in range, you don't here it. There is nothing there to convert the actual wave into a readable sound.

Think of it like an empty bus. The bus still goes to the destination, but without anyone on the bus, no one gets to that destination.

Edit: Why do people keep bringing up "well animals live in a forest"

Cause if your bringing that up, then you don't understand the question. The question says "if NO ONE IS AROUND to hear it"

"No one" means any being that can hear a sound. Since when does "No one" specifically mean "No human?"

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Ryu](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 11:24:20 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

The question is:

"If a tree falls in the forest and no one is around, does it make a sound?"

Yes.

The question isn't "If a tree falls in the forest, and you're not there, Does it still make a sound?"

No, you don't hear it, But it still makes a sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [nopol10](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 12:15:25 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

There is no way we can find out, so we should stop pondering.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Herr Surth](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 12:28:27 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

PSEUDO PHILOSOPHY IS NOT COOL.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 12:29:18 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 07:09Cheesesoda, your not getting what I said... of course all that other stuff would still exist (according to most logic anyway)

But a sound is different. I'm talking about using the information in the question, you don't hear the sound, the sound doesn't happen.

I'm betting most people here are probably thinking "Ok, so since no one was around to hear it, if I just imagine what it was like to be there and relate it to the sound of a tree falling, of course it made a sound"

If anyone is thinking like that, your wrong. Your not there, you can't hear it if your not there.

The tree falls down, causing soundwaves to spread out. However, nothing is within the range of the sound waves that are going to hear the sound before it dissipates. If your not in range, you don't here it. There is nothing there to convert the actual wave into a readable sound.

Think of it like an empty bus. The bus still goes to the destination, but without anyone on the bus, no one gets to that destination.

Edit: Why do people keep bringing up "well animals live in a forest"

Cause if your bringing that up, then you don't understand the question. The question says "if NO ONE IS AROUND to hear it"

"No one" means any being that can hear a sound. Since when does "No one" specifically mean "No human?"

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [The Elite Officer](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 16:55:03 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 07:09Cheesesoda, your not getting what I said... of course all that other stuff would still exist (according to most logic anyway)

But a sound is different. I'm talking about using the information in the question, you don't hear the sound, the sound doesn't happen.

I'm betting most people here are probably thinking "Ok, so since no one was around to hear it, if I just imagine what it was like to be there and relate it to the sound of a tree falling, of course it made a sound"

If anyone is thinking like that, your wrong. Your not there, you can't hear it if your not there.

The tree falls down, causing soundwaves to spread out. However, nothing is within the range of

the sound waves that are going to hear the sound before it dissipates. If your not in range, you don't here it. There is nothing there to convert the actual wave into a readable sound.

Think of it like an empty bus. The bus still goes to the destination, but without anyone on the bus, no one gets to that destination.

Edit: Why do people keep bringing up "well animals live in a forest"

Cause if your bringing that up, then you don't understand the question. The question says "if NO ONE IS AROUND to hear it"

"No one" means any being that can hear a sound. Since when does "No one" specifically mean "No human?"

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound?

Yes because there are some dog wisles that people can hear, so if you blow that kind of whisle and no dog is around but a person is, then that person can hear it and then they have heard that wistle.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Herr Surth](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 16:57:53 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

whistle! whistle! whistle!

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [The Elite Officer](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 16:59:08 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Surth wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 12:57whistle! whistle! whistle!

Do you hear something??????

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [luv2pb](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 17:09:59 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

So if you have to hear it for it to be a sound what happens if I leave a audio recording device in the woods? Then I run away and after I'm gone the tree falls (say 1:46pm). Does that mean that

when I listen to the device later (say 5:13) the tree makes the sound then at 5:13 and not 1:46pm?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 18:52:24 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound? Yes it makes a sound. Whether we actually hear it or not, the sound is there. It is just at a frequency that most people can't hear.

The difference is though, our brain or anything that can hear a sound's brain is receiving those soundwaves. Whether or not they actually hear the sound, there is still sound.

The difference is with the original question, there is nothing there to receive the sound from the soundwaves and thus nothing to project the sound onto. If the sound isn't projected onto anything, there is no sound.

Here is another example.

You're in a field during the day. The sun is beating down lighting up the entire field.

You have with you a wooden board, and a flashlight. If you turn on the flashlight and point it at the wooden board, no matter how light it is outside, you will see the light reflect off of the board.

However, if you take the board away and flash the flashlight into the open air, you will not see the light. Because there is nothing there that can reflect the lesser light of the flashlight over the natural sunlight coming down. Therefore you don't see any light coming from the flash light.

Understand?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 19:07:55 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 The difference is with the original question, there is nothing there to receive the sound from the soundwaves and thus nothing to project the sound onto. If the sound isn't projected onto anything, there is no sound.

Correct me if I'm wrong, but our atmosphere is filled with molecules, correct? Oxygen, Carbon Dioxide, Nitrogen, etc...

If I'm correct in saying that, then the atmosphere is filled with atoms. Atoms have mass. Thus, they are matter. THUS, the sound DOES, indeed, get projected onto these atoms. How else does

sound travel, if not through matter?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [jnz](#) on Fri, 05 Oct 2007 19:12:50 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

[quote title=razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 19:52]cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29
However, if you take the board away and flash the flashlight into the open air, you will not see the light. Because there is nothing there that can reflect the lesser light of the flashlight over the natural sunlight coming down. Therefore you don't see any light coming from the flash light.

Understand?

Well, that's depends on where you point the flashlight. If you point it into your face, then you see the light. If you point it away from you, you will not. If you pointed the flashlight away from you when it was foggy, you would see the light reflecting from the fog.

As for the sound, when the tree hits the floor it creates sound, period. That sound is converted into waves that travel through earth and air. weather something detects those waves doesn't matter, they were still created and thus it made a sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [z310](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 00:21:53 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Schrödinger's cat is dead.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [DarkKnight](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 00:22:01 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

actually the question really should be if a man speaks and no woman is around to hear him is he still wrong?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Jecht](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 03:20:43 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Darkknight wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 19:22actually the question really should be if a man speaks and no woman is around to hear him is he still wrong?

The answer to that question is yes unless no other woman exists on the planet he occupies

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Jonty](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 07:04:32 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

If an atom of sodium collides with an atom of chlorine, but only a handful of people in the world can see it, is there no salt other than on the plate of an electron microscope?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 13:23:20 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

GAH! Everyone is so think headed... no one is understanding what I am saying...

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Herr Surth](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 13:26:13 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Thats because what you say is plain stupid.

And this isnt Schroedingers Cat btw.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 13:55:47 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

No it is cause no one is understanding what I am saying. I'm thinking it is too "outside the box" for people to understand...

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Herr Surth](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 13:59:54 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

ok.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [cheesesoda](#) on Sat, 06 Oct 2007 19:53:41 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 wrote on Sat, 06 October 2007 09:55No it is cause no one is understanding what I am saying. I'm thinking it is too "outside the box" for people to understand...
No, my logic is just too much for you. Just because you don't witness it doesn't mean that it can't possibly exist. It's just pure ignorance to say that something can't exist because you didn't witness it. It's like some idiot Christian saying the Big Bang didn't happen because they didn't witness it, or some Atheist saying that the Creation didn't happen because they didn't witness it.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Sun, 07 Oct 2007 02:57:51 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

What you just explained is not what I been explaining. Therefor you don't understand what I am saying..

But you are still wrong with that theory.. well not "wrong" but it is being looked into.
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Anthropic_principle
<http://www.reasons.org/resources/apologetics/design.shtml>
<http://quasar.as.utexas.edu/anthropic.html>
<http://www.google.com/search?hl=en&client=firefox-a&rls=org.mozilla:en-US:official&hs=6ug&sa=X&oi=spell&resnum=0&ct=result&cd=1&q=anthropic+principle&spell=1>

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [z310](#) on Sun, 07 Oct 2007 21:02:34 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Surth wrote on Sat, 06 October 2007 09:26And this isnt Schroedingers Cat btw.
Things may change when no observer is present. Same idea.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [GeneralCF](#) on Sun, 07 Oct 2007 23:59:11 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Quote:If a tree falls in a forest, and no one hears it, does it make a sound?

Its obvious. The answer is yes. It like: Are there life in other parts of the world, if you cant see them?

As far as I know, in Africa, Europe, Asia, Oceania (sp?) and the rest of South-America, Central America and America there is life. Despite the fact that I can't be everywhere, there is life in the rest of the world. Then its another yes, and this reply can be used for replying the other question.

What do you think? Is the same discussion or not?

Regards

GeneralCF

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Mon, 08 Oct 2007 01:09:47 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Hearing isn't seeing.

I said "If no one is around to hear it"

That means no living thing is there to hear it. Being able to see something that is microscopic has nothing to do with the question. They are living, therefore they can't be in the area, or else your answering some complete other question.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [z310](#) on Mon, 08 Oct 2007 02:52:52 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 wrote on Sun, 07 October 2007 21:09Hearing isn't seeing.

I said "If no one is around to hear it"

I pretty sure that cliché question doesn't mean what you're getting at. You should of specified what you meant at the beginning. Ambiguously, I'm sure it just refers to if no animal is around.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [The Elite Officer](#) on Mon, 08 Oct 2007 15:53:02 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 14:52cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound? Yes it makes a sound. Weather we actually hear it nor not, the sound is there. It is just at a frequency that most people can't hear.

The difference is though, our brain or anything that can hear a sound's brain is receiving those soundwaves. Weather or not they actually hear the sound, there is still sound.

The difference is with the original question, there is nothing there to receive the sound from the soundwaves and thus nothing to project the sound onto. If the sound isn't projected onto anything, there is no sound.

Here is another example.

Your in a field during the day. The sun is beating down lighting up the entire field.

You have with you a wooden board, and a flashlight. If you turn on the flashlight and point it at the wooden board, no matter how light it is outside, you will see the light reflect off of the board.

However, if you take the board away and flash the flashlight into the open air, you will not see the light. Because there is nothing there that can reflect the lesser light of the flashlight over the natural sunlight coming down. Therefore you don't see any light coming from the flash light.

Understand?

Nailed it.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Renerage](#) on Mon, 08 Oct 2007 23:39:18 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

The Elite Officer wrote on Mon, 08 October 2007 11:53razorblade001 wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 14:52cheesesoda wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 08:29

Okay, so let's change the question to something parallel to it:

If you blow a dog whistle, and no dog is around to hear it, are you still making a sound?

Yes it makes a sound. Weather we actually hear it nor not, the sound is there. It is just at a frequency that most people can't hear.

The difference is though, our brain or anything that can hear a sound's brain is receiving those soundwaves. Weather or not they actually hear the sound, there is still sound.

The difference is with the original question, there is nothing there to receive the sound from the soundwaves and thus nothing to project the sound onto. If the sound isn't projected onto anything, there is no sound.

Here is another example.

Your in a field during the day. The sun is beating down lighting up the entire field.

You have with you a wooden board, and a flashlight. If you turn on the flashlight and point it at the wooden board, no matter how light it is outside, you will see the light reflect off of the board.

However, if you take the board away and flash the flashlight into the open air, you will not see the light. Because there is nothing there that can reflect the lesser light of the flashlight over the natural sunlight coming down. Therefore you don't see any light coming from the flash light.

Understand?

Nailed it.

No he didnt. He brought objects into it.

The light is still there, our eyes just cant see it.

Heres a question- Smart one-

You have night heat vision goggles on, during the day, you light your light into the sky-

An powerful noe, not a dinky flash light. Other then the yellow/orange you see around you, you will see a dark red beam of light.

BUT ZOMGZ HACKS THE LIGHTS NOT THERE

You people need to get off this arguement,

Why do you people think that jsut because we dont see it/hear it it doesnt happen?

Thats the most illogical excuse I've EVER heard.

Some of you, are making yourselves look stupid.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Starbuzz](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 00:41:35 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Exactly...pointless speculation about some irrelavent bullshit.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [Matix101](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 00:42:34 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Who cares?

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [BlueThen](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 00:43:03 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Renerage wrote on Mon, 08 October 2007 18:39

Why do you people think that jsut because we dont see it/hear it it doesnt happen?

Thats the most illogical excuse I've EVER heard.

Some of you, are making yourselves look stupid.

In my theory, I used the definition to back it up. A sound is vibrations taken from the organs and

such. Though there was another one said vibrations through the air.

Again, I answered yes and no.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...

Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 02:59:10 GMT

[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Renerage wrote on Mon, 08 October 2007 19:39

No he didnt. He brought objects into it.

The light is still there, our eyes just cant see it.

Heres a question- Smart one-

You have night heat vision goggles on, during the day, you light your light into the sky-

An powerful noe, not a dinky flash light. Other then the yellow/orange you see around you, you will see a dark red beam of light.

BUT ZOMGZ HACKS THE LIGHTS NOT THERE

You people need to get off this arguement,

Why do you people think that jsut because we dont see it/hear it it doesnt happen?

Thats the most illogical excuse I've EVER heard.

Some of you, are making yourselves look stupid.

Lol dude, what do you think the point of my example was? That if we can't see it, it isn't there?

No, the point of my example is that even though we can't see it, it IS there. Way to restate my example through a much more confusing one... lol.

But anyway, lets bring about a close to this argument.

The answer is not "Yes" it isn't "No" the answer is simply unknown.

No matter how you define sound. Either as receiving the sensation of a sound wave and actually hearing something. Or sound being the actual sound wave itself.

The answer is unknown because since no one is there, unlike everywhere else, there is no way to prove that a sound wave even was created!

Think about it. When sound waves where discovered, and from then on observed, there was always at least one living thing that can perceive sound present. So whose to say that if there isn't any one/thing present at the time of the incident that is supposed to send out a sound wave, that a sound wave would even happen. There is no way to experiment and test the theory, and there is no way to prove one occurred or one didn't occur.

You can use all the logic you want, but when it comes down to it, you just cannot prove that a sound wave even was created. Thus the answer to the question is simply "Unknown"

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Renerage](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 05:20:44 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Whether im with you, or not,
The point is-
The sound is there, the light it there.
We just may not see/hear it to consider it there.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 05:35:46 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

I don't get why you keep telling me that. I already said that before...

See I did say it:Yes it makes a sound. Weather we actually hear it nor not, the sound is there. It is just at a frequency that most people can't hear.

The difference is though, our brain or anything that can hear a sound's brain is receiving those soundwaves. Weather or not they actually hear the sound, there is still sound.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Renerage](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 05:49:36 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

But then the arguement-
Does it make a sound? Makes no sence.
We dont need to hear sound for it to happen.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [DarkKnight](#) on Tue, 09 Oct 2007 23:57:39 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Jecht wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 22:20Darkknight wrote on Fri, 05 October 2007 19:22actually the question really should be if a man speaks and no woman is around to hear him is he still wrong?

The answer to that question is yes unless no other woman exists on the planet he occupies

we should debate this would be more fun

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Wed, 10 Oct 2007 04:27:50 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

I don't believe so. I think that as long as no woman hears it, he isn't wrong. Lol

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Jerad2142](#) on Wed, 17 Oct 2007 00:56:55 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

There is only one way to find out:
Put a tap recorder in a forest, let it record, after a tree just happens to fall down come back and replay the tap.
As there was no one around if there is a sound on the tape that means there was a sound.

I have yet to test this but it should work

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Rocko](#) on Wed, 17 Oct 2007 05:08:27 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

you shouldnt be knocking down trees

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [Jerad2142](#) on Wed, 17 Oct 2007 16:44:56 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

Rocko wrote on Tue, 16 October 2007 23:08you shouldnt be knocking down trees
Knocking down? I was thinking something more along the lines of starting a fire. LOL, just kidding.

Subject: Re: If a tree falls in the forest...
Posted by [R315r4z0r](#) on Wed, 17 Oct 2007 19:16:13 GMT
[View Forum Message](#) <> [Reply to Message](#)

No, if you put a tape recorder there, someone will eventually hear it, and that voids the question.

You can put a tap recorder there... but... your not allowed to listen to what's on the tape.
